



**Pacific Northwest
Writers Association**

Reviewer 1

CATEGORY 10: Adult Short Story

ENTRY #__0386_____ TITLE__Herb Short's Story_____

1. Plot: (Is there internal and external conflict, complications and structure?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) **(10)** (Circle one, write comments)

This is an extremely well done piece. The plot is tight, gripping. While it can sometimes be trite to do a flashback when someone takes a fall, it is perfect in this case. Herb was already in the past, and the open flashback works perfectly. The transition is seamless. Taking us back to the alley is a telling, but unfortunately all too true, commentary on our treatment of veterans.

2. Viewpoint: (Is the point of view consistent or does it wander from one type to another?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) **(10)** (Circle one, write comments)

Great choice for this story. Herb tells us enough about how he's feeling and thinking. First person would be too much like crawling into his skin--which is a place I'd rather see from the outside. The facts of this situation have enough impact. I don't want to think of Herb as a broken man. I am forced to see this by displaying it in front of me as reality, not a drunk man's fantasy. I can empathize more with Herb in the third person than I would in first.

3. Characterization: (Does the reader identify with the characters? Does the reader care about the characters? Is there a variety of character types?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) **(10)** (Circle one, write comments)

One of the best renditions of character I've seen in a very long time. Not only do we see Herb, but we get a really good sense of Ace Riley as well. The fact that Herb recognizes the policeman explains some of Herb's present life. The kick might not have been necessary, though, in order to make the point.

4. Pacing: (Does the pacing have variety, unpredictability, and momentum?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) **(10)** (Circle one, write comments)

Tense. Moving. My eyes didn't turn away from the page even for a moment. Having to stop and turn the pages seemed too much of a pause. Fantastic.

5. Dialogue: (Does the dialogue advance the plot and create tension, conflict, and suspense? Is the dialogue distinct to each character?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) **(10)** (Circle one, write comments)

Reviewer 1

Effective, realistic. It drives the story and develops the characters. Nearly the entire story is in dialogue.

6. Setting/Description: (Is the setting believable? Does the author establish time, mood and atmosphere?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

I'm there under that banyan tree, and I'm there in the alley. I can see the mayor getting most uncomfortable. There is not too much description and not too little, either.

7. Narrative: (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

Word choices evoke times. "Dames in pillbox hats and mink" sets the time and place with a tiny brush stroke. The writing is smooth, professional. The voice is strong.

Couple of notes. The reference to the key of the city on page 13 bumped me for a second while I told myself that we aren't back in Seattle yet. And the last sentence didn't quite work for me. Not sure what it is that's "pretty good." It doesn't seem to be a response to anything in particular--not the words of the couple or any internal monologue. I could hear myself asking "better than what?"

8. Mechanics: (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

Couple of teensy things. On page 3, "I saw a lot of action; a lot of days when . . ." Are you sure you want a semicolon there? What follows it isn't an independent clause. And is "Idunno" one word or two?

9. Did story grab you? (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

Absolutely. I won't forget this story anytime soon.

10. Would you read more stories from this author? (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10)
(Circle one, write comments)

Read more? Where is it? Let me at it.

Additional Comments may be written on the back of the form or an additional sheet.

Score: _____ 98 _____ (Possible 100)



Reviewer 2

CATEGORY 10: Adult Short Story

ENTRY #__0386__ TITLE__Herb Short's story__

1. Plot: (Is there internal and external conflict, complications and structure?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

The story is filled with internal and external conflicts.

2. Viewpoint: (Is the point of view consistent or does it wander from one type to another?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

The viewpoint is consistently the Herb's.

3. Characterization: (Does the reader identify with the characters? Does the reader care about the characters? Is there a variety of character types?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

A regular person, living, fighting & dying for his country. Seeing horror, and having his accomplishments taken by someone seeking fame. Herb is a very sympathetic character.

4. Pacing: (Does the pacing have variety, unpredictability, and momentum?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

The pace / flow is smooth and linear.

5. Dialogue: (Does the dialogue advance the plot and create tension, conflict, and suspense? Is the dialogue distinct to each character?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

The dialogue advances the plot and creates tension and revelations.

6. Setting/Description: (Is the setting believable? Does the author establish time, mood and atmosphere?) (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

The settings are vivid and believable.

7. Narrative: (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)

There is a strong singular voice

Reviewer 2

8. Mechanics: (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)
There are several run on sentences, but they don't detract from the story.

9. Did story grab you? (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10) (Circle one, write comments)
The first two paragraphs, while informative, do not have a strong hook. You might consider herb reading the sign from page 14, taking a deep breath...or drink, and gathering his courage to enter the auditorium. This might foreshadow the conflict to come.

10. Would you read more stories from this author? (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) (6) (7) (8) (9) (10)
(Circle one, write comments)
It's an engaging and emotional story, and I want to know how factual it is.

Additional Comments may be written on the back of the form or an additional sheet.

Score: 82 (Possible 100)

Pg 13- first paragraph. When Herb is on the jungle island and holding Joe, how does he know that Major Riley is getting a key to the city?